

To: Burt Shephard/R10/USEPA/US@EPA[]
Cc: Joe Goulet/R10/USEPA/US@EPA[]
From: "Keefe, Jennifer"
Sent: Tue 3/13/2012 1:36:29 PM
Subject: Portland Harbor Specific Comments for Formal Responses
7-1-11 BERA Response to EPA Comments Draft Final JK 3.12.12 Shephard.xlsx

Hi Burt,

Your review assignment spreadsheet identifies that you tasked yourself with the review of the original DRAFT BERA for Portland Harbor with a specific interest in the following topics: compliance with problem formulation, risk management issues, water, TZW, and tissue sections. Additionally, you requested that all members of the team think about data presentation/figures and localized risks. Thus, I have compiled the attached spreadsheet that includes comments that I thought covered those topics. This spreadsheet is a smaller version of the larger spreadsheet circulated during the meeting in Portland. I have done some additional work, so this one includes the most up-to-date "CDM review comments" from me. I have not included comments that you and I reviewed together at the meeting or those that you completed as indicated in the next weekly call. I have included your formal responses to those comments in the master file.

The comments included in this spreadsheet are (yes there are many!): the first # 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 8, 10, 11; 13.2, 13.3, 13.4, 13.6, 13.7, 13.8, The second #1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13; 14, 15, 17, 18, 20, 21, 22, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 34, 35, 36, 38, 39, 40, 41, 42, 43, 45, 46, 52, 54, 55, 56, 57, 58, 60, 61, 62, 64, 65, 67, 68, 69, 73, 75, 78, 79, 82, 83, 85, 86, 87, 90, 91, 92, 96, 98, 99, 100, 101, 103, 106, 109, 110, 111, 112, 115, 123, 126, 127, 131, 132, 137, 141, 142, 143, 144, 145, 147, 148, 149, 151, 153, 157, 164, 172, 173, 174, 175, 176, 177, 178, 179, 180, 181, 183, 184, 185, 186, 187, 188, 189, 190, 192, 199, 200, 201, 202, 203, 204, 205, 208, 209 (your review topics) as well as #17, 37, 97 (comments that have a data presentation/localized risk component that are not already included in your topic list).

Here is my request so that we meet our deadline:

The comments listed above in purple are those that I have labeled as "addressed." Note that the color coding in the spreadsheet is separate from that of this email. Please look at the CDM Comments to make sure you agree with my conclusion. If you agree, I will note in the formalized response that they have been resolved and that no further action is needed (whatever formal language Burt decides we should include for those comments). If you disagree with my assessment, please provide a revised formalized response. The comments listed above in black are those that I have categorized as being "partially addressed" or "not addressed." Please use my notes in the "CDM Review Comment" as guidance and provide me with a formalized response in the "New EPA Comment" and "New Comment Code" fields.

Items to note:

Please remember that I was not to review/make a judgment regarding the quality of the response and I could not evaluate compliance with subsequent agreements made that LWG references. Also, I did not often take LWG's response into consideration when reviewing.

The page numbers, sections, paragraph numbers are based on the clean version of the revised DRAFT FINAL BERA.

If I have misidentified comments that you think are better directed to someone else on the team, please let me know and I can re-direct them appropriately.

If you feel as though I have missed comments that you should comment on, please let me know and I can either send you a revised spreadsheet or you can add your additional formalized responses to an email and I will incorporate them into the final spreadsheet.

Color codes within the spreadsheet (separate from color coding in this email) are at the top of the first page.

If you have any questions or concerns, please let me know.

Thank you in advance for your assistance,
Jenn

Jennifer Keefe, M.P.H.
Environmental Scientist
CDM Smith
50 Hampshire Street
Cambridge, MA 02139
Tel/Fax: 617.452.6314
keefejm@cdmsmith.com
cdmsmith.com